APPEAL

United States District Court District of Massachusetts (Boston) CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:04-cv-11109-RGS Internal Use Only

Lexington Insurance Company et al v. Virginia Surety

Company, Incorporated

Assigned to: Judge Richard G. Stearns

Cause: 28:1332 Diversity-Insurance Contract

Date Filed: 05/26/2004 Jury Demand: None

Nature of Suit: 110 Insurance

Jurisdiction: Diversity

Plaintiff

Lexington Insurance Company

represented by Mark E. Cohen

The McCormack Firm LLC One International Place Boston, MA 02110-0140

617-951-2929 Fax: 617-951-2672

Email: mcohen@mccormackfirm.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gerald S. Frim

McCormack & Epstein One International Place Boston, MA 02110-0140

617-951-2929 Fax: 617-951-2672

Email: gfrim@mccormackfirm.com ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA.

represented by Mark E. Cohen

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gerald S. Frim

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated

represented by John Michael Stephan

Mintz, Levin, Cohn, Ferris, Glovsky &

Popeo, PC

One Financial Center Boston, MA 02111 617-542-6000 Fax: 617-542-2241

Email: jmstephan@mintz.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Nicholas C Cramb

Mintz, Levin, Cohn, Ferris, Glovsky & Popeo. PC One Financial Center Boston, MA 02111 617-348-1740 Email: nccramb@mintz.com ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated

represented by Joseph G. Blute

Mintz, Levin, Cohn, Ferris, Glovsky & Popeo, PC One Financial Center Boston, MA 02111 617-542-6000 Fax: 617-542-2241 Email: jblute@mintz.com LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John Michael Stephan (See above for address) ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Counter Defendant

Lexington Insurance Company

represented by Mark E. Cohen

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gerald S. Frim

(See above for address) ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Defendant

National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA.

represented by Mark E. Cohen

(See above for address) LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Gerald S. Frim (See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

Virginia Surety Company,

Incorporated

represented by Joseph G. Blute

(See above for address)

V.

Counter Defendant

Lexington Insurance Company

represented by Gerald S. Frim

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Defendant

National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA.

represented by Gerald S. Frim

(See above for address) ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

#	Docket Text
\bullet_1	COMPLAINT Filing fee: \$ 150, receipt number 56206, filed by Lexington Insurance Company.(Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 05/27/2004)
)	If the trial Judge issues an Order of Reference of any matter in this case to a Magistrate Judge, the matter will be transmitted to Magistrate Judge Bowler. (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 05/27/2004)
(2)	CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT by Lexington Insurance Company. (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 05/27/2004)
2 3	CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT by National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 05/27/2004)
9 5	STIPULATION extending time to answer by 7/28/04 by Lexington Insurance Company, Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated. (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 07/14/2004)
(3 4)	SUMMONS Returned Executed Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated served on 6/9/2004, answer due 6/29/2004. (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 07/08/2004)
(3 6)	ANSWER to Complaint with Jury Demand, COUNTERCLAIM against Lexington Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA. by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated.(Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 07/29/2004)

07/28/2004	3 7	MOTION to Strike exhibit E and paragraph 17 of complaint by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated.(Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 07/29/2004)
07/29/2004	3	***Attorney John Michael Stephan for Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated added. (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 07/29/2004)
08/02/2004	3 8	NOTICE of Scheduling Conference. Scheduling Conference set for 9/1/2004 03:45 PM in Courtroom 21 before Judge Richard G. Stearns. (Johnson, Mary) (Entered: 08/03/2004)
08/02/2004	'@ 9	NOTICE of Scheduling Conference. Scheduling Conference set for 9/1/2004 03:45 PM in Courtroom 21 before Judge Richard G. Stearns. (Johnson, Mary) (Entered: 08/03/2004)
08/03/2004	3	Remark to counsel. The Notice of 16b Conference for September 1, 2004 was electronically sent to counsel in this case INCORRECTLY.A CORRECTED Notice will be electronically sent shortly for CA 04-11109-RGS(Lexington Ins. v. Virginia Surety Co.). Mary Johnson, Deputy Clerk to Stearns, DJ. (Johnson, Mary) (Entered: 08/03/2004)
08/11/2004	(2 10)	MOTION for Extension of Time to 8/25/04 to oppose motion to strike exhibit E and Paragraph 17 of original complaint by Lexington Insurance Company.(Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 08/16/2004)
08/16/2004	(11)	ANSWER to Counterclaim by Lexington Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA(Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 08/18/2004)
08/23/2004	•	Judge Richard G. Stearns: Endorsed ORDER entered granting 10 Motion for Extension of Time (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 08/24/2004)
08/26/2004	13	NOTICE of no opposition by Lexington Insurance Company re 7 MOTION to Strike (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 09/01/2004)
08/27/2004	12	JOINT STATEMENT re scheduling conference. (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 09/01/2004)
09/01/2004	•	Electronic Clerk's Notes for proceedings held before Judge Richard G. Stearns: Scheduling Conference held on 9/1/2004. Attys. Cohen and Maselek present for the pltf. Attys. Blute and Stephan present for the deft. All discovery other than non-expert discovery shall be completed by 6-1-05. On or before 7-1-05, either side has the option to file a dispositive motion. If no dispositive motions are filed, the parties can continue with the proposed discovery schedule agreed to by each side. (Court Reporter None.) (Johnson, Mary) Modified on 9/16/2004 (Johnson, Mary). (Entered: 09/16/2004)
09/02/2004	14	CERTIFICATION pursuant to Local Rule 16.1 by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated.(Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 09/07/2004)
09/17/2004	3	Judge Richard G. Stearns: Electronic ORDER entered granting 7 Motion to Strike 7 MOTION to Strike (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 09/20/2004)
11/23/2004	3 (5))Unopposed MOTION for Leave to File amended complaint by Lexington

		Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA(Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 11/24/2004)
11/29/2004	3	Judge Richard G. Stearns: Electronic ORDER entered granting <u>15</u> Motion for Leave to File (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 11/30/2004)
11/29/2004	16	AMENDED COMPLAINT against Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated, filed by Lexington Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA(Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 12/02/2004)
12/06/2004	2 17	ANSWER to Amended Complaint, COUNTERCLAIM against Lexington Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA. by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated. (Attachments: # 1 # 2 # 3)(Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 12/08/2004)
12/23/2004	18	ANSWER to Counterclaim by Lexington Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA(Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 12/28/2004)
04/12/2005	<u>19</u>	MOTION to Modify scheduling order and for an order limiting discovery by Lexington Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA(Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 04/13/2005)
04/12/2005	(20)	AFFIDAVIT in Support re 19 MOTION to Modify scheduling order and for an order limiting discovery. (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 04/13/2005)
04/12/2005	(21)	AFFIDAVIT in Support re 19 MOTION to Modify scheduling order and for an order limiting discovery. (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 04/13/2005)
04/12/2005	22	MEMORANDUM in Support re 19 MOTION to Modify scheduling order and for an order limiting discovery filed by Lexington Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA (Attachments: #1)(Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 04/13/2005)
04/26/2005	2 23	MEMORANDUM in Opposition re 19 MOTION to Modify scheduling order and for an order limiting discovery filed by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated. (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 04/27/2005)
05/02/2005	3	Judge Richard G. Stearns: Electronic ORDER entered denying 19 Motion for Modification "the proposed phasing of discovery is needlessly complex and offers little by way of advantage to compensate for the delays inherent in the proposed scheduled." cc: all counsel of record. (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 05/02/2005)
08/12/2005	24	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to 11/30/05 to conduct discovery; to 1/10/05 to file dispositive motions: responses by 2/14/05 by Lexington Insurance Company, Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated.(Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 08/15/2005)
08/16/2005	•	Judge Richard G. Stearns: Electronic ORDER entered granting in part 24 Motion for Extension of Time "Oppositions to dispositive motions are to be filed within twenty-one (21) days of 1/10/05." (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 08/16/2005)

11/22/2005	<u>225</u>	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to 3/31/06 to Complete Discovery; file dispositive motions by 4/17/06; opps 5/8/06 by Lexington Insurance Company, Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated.(Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 11/29/2005)
11/23/2005	3	Judge Richard G. Stearns: Electronic ORDER entered granting <u>25</u> Motion for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 11/29/2005)
03/22/2006	<u>26</u>	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to 120 days to Complete Discovery by Lexington Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA., Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated.(Frim, Gerald) (Entered: 03/22/2006)
03/22/2006	27	STATEMENT OF COUNSEL of Lexington re Complaince with L.R. 7.1 (a)(2) re 26 Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to 120 days to Complete Discovery by Lexington Insurance Company. (Frim, Gerald) (Entered: 03/22/2006)
03/31/2006	3	Judge Richard G. Stearns: Electronic ORDER entered denying <u>26</u> Motion for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery (Flaherty. Elaine) (Entered: 03/31/2006)
04/05/2006	2 28	MOTION for Reconsideration re Order on Motion for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated. (Cramb, Nicholas) (Entered: 04/05/2006)
04/05/2006	29	AFFIDAVIT of Nicholas C. Cramb in Support re <u>28</u> MOTION for Reconsideration re Order on Motion for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery filed by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A# <u>2</u> Exhibit B)(Cramb, Nicholas) (Entered: 04/05/2006)
04/06/2006	330	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to May 1, 2006 to File Dispositive Motions by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated.(Cramb, Nicholas) (Entered: 04/06/2006)
04/06/2006	3	Judge Richard G. Stearns: Electronic ORDER entered granting 30 Motion for Extension of Time. Dispositive Motions due by 5/1/2006. (Johnson, Mary) (Entered: 04/06/2006)
04/07/2006	3	Judge Richard G. Stearns: Electronic ORDER entered granting <u>28</u> Motion for Reconsideration "Allowed. Discovery is to be completed in 120 days of the date of this Order." (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 04/10/2006)
07/28/2006	<u>@31</u>	MOTION for Order to Set Briefing Schedule for Dispositive Motions by all parties.(Frim, Gerald) (Entered: 07/28/2006)
08/04/2006	3	Judge Richard G. Stearns: Electronic ORDER entered granting 31 Motion for Order. "dispositive motions due 9-29-06; oppositions due 10-30-06; reply briefs due by 11-13-06." (Johnson, Mary) (Entered: 08/07/2006)

09/15/2006		Joint MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages of All Parties by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated, Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated. (Cramb, Nicholas) (Entered: 09/15/2006)
09/19/2006		Judge Richard G. Stearns: Electronic ORDER entered granting <u>32</u> Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages "Thirty pages (but no more) is acceptable." (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 09/19/2006)
09/29/2006		MOTION for Summary Judgment by Lexington Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA., Lexington Insurance Company. National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh. PA (Attachments: # 1 Memorandum of Law# 2 Statement of Undisputed Facts# 3 Affidavit Affidavit of Charles J. Messery# 4 Affidavit Affidavit of Jack B. Gould# 5 Affidavit Affidavit of Elizabeth Viscione)(Frim, Gerald) (Entered: 09/29/2006)
09/29/2006		NOTICE by Lexington Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA., Lexington Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA. re 33 MOTION for Summary Judgment: Notice of Filing Exhibits with Clerk's Office (Frim, Gerald) (Entered: 09/29/2006)
09/29/2006	4 35	MOTION for Summary Judgment by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated.(Cramb, Nicholas) (Entered: 09/29/2006)
09/29/2006	(236)	MEMORANDUM in Support re 35 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated. (Cramb, Nicholas) (Entered: 09/29/2006)
09/29/2006	3.7	AFFIDAVIT in Support re 35 MOTION for Summary Judgment. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A# 2 Exhibit B# 3 Exhibit C# 4 Exhibit D# 5 Exhibit E# 6 Exhibit F# 7 Exhibit G# 8 Exhibit H# 9 Exhibit I, Part 1# 10 Exhibit I, Part 2# 11 Exhibit J)(Cramb, Nicholas) (Entered: 09/29/2006)
09/29/2006	38)	STATEMENT of facts re 35 MOTION for Summary Judgment. (Cramb, Nicholas) (Entered: 09/29/2006)
09/29/2006	4 39	NOTICE by Lexington Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA., Lexington Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA. re 33 MOTION for Summary JudgmentRequest for Oral Argument and Rule 7.1(A)(2) Certification (Frim, Gerald) (Entered: 09/29/2006)
10/04/2006	3 (40)	CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated. (Cramb, Nicholas) (Entered: 10/04/2006)
10/26/2006	3	ELECTRONIC NOTICE of Hearing on Motion 35 MOTION for Summary Judgment. 33 MOTION for Summary Judgment: Motion Hearing set for 2/2/2007 02:30 PM in Courtroom 21 before Judge Richard G. Stearns. (Johnson, Mary) (Entered: 10/26/2006)
10/30/2006	41)	Opposition re 33 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated. (Cramb. Nicholas) (Entered: 10/30/2006)

10/30/2006	<u>42</u>	Response by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated to <u>33 MOTION</u> for Summary Judgment, <i>Attachment 2 - Statement of Undisputed Facts</i> . (Cramb, Nicholas) (Entered: 10/30/2006)
10/30/2006	43	MEMORANDUM in Opposition re 35 MOTION for Summary Judgment of Defendant Virginia Surety Co. filed by all plaintiffs. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Exhibit A# 2 Exhibit Exhibit B# 3 Exhibit Exhibit C# 4 Exhibit Exhibit D# 5 Exhibit Exhibit E)(Frim, Gerald) (Entered: 10/30/2006)
10/30/2006	44	Statement of Material Facts L.R. 56.1 re 35 MOTION for Summary Judgment of Defendant. Virginia Surety Co., Inc. filed by all plaintiffs. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Exhibit A# 2 Exhibit Exhibit B# 3 Exhibit Exhibit C)(Frim, Gerald) (Entered: 10/30/2006)
11/13/2006	(45)	REPLY to Response to Motion re 33 MOTION for Summary Judgment, 35 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by all plaintiffs. (Frim, Gerald) (Entered: 11/13/2006)
11/13/2006	46	REPLY to Response to Motion re 35 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated. (Cramb, Nicholas) (Entered: 11/13/2006)
11/13/2006	47	AFFIDAVIT in Support re <u>46</u> Reply to Response to Motion for Summary Judgment of Virginia Surety Company. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A) (Cramb, Nicholas) (Entered: 11/13/2006)
11/27/2006	4 8)	MOTION for Leave to File <i>Surreply</i> by Lexington Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1 - Proposed Surreply of Plaintiffs)(Frim, Gerald) (Entered: 11/27/2006)
11/29/2006	49)	Second MOTION to Strike <i>the Heist Letter</i> by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated.(Cramb. Nicholas) (Entered: 11/29/2006)
12/11/2006	9 50)	Opposition re 48 MOTION for Leave to File <i>Surreply</i> filed by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated, Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated. (Stephan, John) (Entered: 12/11/2006)
12/13/2006	9 51)	Opposition re 49 Second MOTION to Strike the Heist Letter filed by all plaintiffs. (Frim, Gerald) (Entered: 12/13/2006)
12/14/2006	3	Judge Richard G. Stearns: Electronic ORDER entered denying 48 Motion for Leave to File; (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 12/14/2006)
02/01/2007	<u>52</u>	MOTION for Leave to File Supplemental Authority by Lexington Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1 - Supplemental Authority) (Frim, Gerald) (Entered: 02/01/2007)
02/02/2007	•	ElectronicClerk's Notes for proceedings held before Judge Richard G. Stearns: Motion Hearing held on 2/2/2007 re: 33 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Lexington Insurance Company and National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA., and 35 MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated.

		Matter taken under advisement. (Court Reporter Carol Scott.) (Hamilton, Maria Raia) (Entered: 02/02/2007)
02/16/2007	3	Judge Richard G. Stearns: Electronic ORDER entered granting 52 Motion for Leave to File; Counsel using the Electronic Case Filing System should now file the document for which leave to file has been granted in accordance with the CM/ECF Administrative Procedures. Counsel must include - Leave to file granted on (date of order)- in the caption of the document. (Hamilton, Maria Raia) (Entered: 02/16/2007)
02/20/2007	53	NOTICE by Lexington Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA. of Filing Supplemental Authority in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit 1 - Supplemental Authority)(Frim, Gerald) (Entered: 02/20/2007)
05/03/2007	54	Judge Richard G. Stearns: ORDER entered. MEMORANDUM AND ORDER on Cross Motions for Summary Judgment, ENTERED. "For the foregoing reasons, Lexington's and National Union's motion for summary judgment is DENIED. Virginia Surety's motion to strike is ALLOWED. Virginia Surety's cross-motion for summary judgment is ALLOWED, in part, as explained in this opinion. The parties will discharge their obligations in a manner consistent with the court's declaration." (Flaherty, Elaine) Modified on 5/3/2007 (Johnson, Mary). (Entered: 05/03/2007)
05/14/2007	(55)	MOTION for Clarification re 54 Memorandum & ORDER,, by Lexington Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA(Frim. Gerald) (Entered: 05/14/2007)
05/14/2007	56	MEMORANDUM in Support re <u>55</u> MOTION for Clarification re <u>54</u> Memorandum & ORDER,, filed by Lexington Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, PA (Frim, Gerald) (Entered: 05/14/2007)
05/14/2007	₹ 57	CERTIFICATE OF CONSULTATION re 55 MOTION for Clarification re 54 Memorandum & ORDER,,. (Frim, Gerald) (Entered: 05/14/2007)
05/25/2007	2 58)	Opposition re <u>55</u> MOTION for Clarification re <u>54</u> Memorandum & ORDER,, filed by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated. (Cramb, Nicholas) (Entered: 05/25/2007)
05/31/2007	2 59)	NOTICE OF APPEAL as to 54 Memorandum & ORDER,, by Lexington Insurance Company. National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh. PA. Filing fee \$ 455. receipt number 1542493 NOTICE TO COUNSEL: A Transcript Report/Order Form, which can be downloaded from the First Circuit Court of Appeals web site at http://www.cal.uscourts.gov/clerks/transcript.htm MUST be completed and submitted to the Court of Appeals.Appeal Record due by 6/20/2007. (Frim, Gerald) (Entered: 05/31/2007)
06/01/2007	<u>460</u>	Judge Richard G. Stearns: ORDER entered finding as moot <u>55</u> Motion for Clarification (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 06/01/2007)

06/06/2007	9 61	MOTION for Reconsideration re <u>60</u> Order on Motion for Clarification by Virginia Surety Company, Incorporated.(Stephan, John) (Entered: 06/06/2007)
06/08/2007	62	Judge Richard G. Stearns: ORDER on Motion for Reconsideration, entered denying 61 Motion for Reconsideration "without prejudice" (Flaherty, Elaine) (Entered: 06/08/2007)